UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06103758 6

CRIMINAL LAW

SECTION I

VOLUME 2

Professor Markus Dubber

Storage
KE
8809
.D82
2010
v.2
c.1

2010-11

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 25 2010

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CRIMINAL LAW

SECTION I

VOLUME 2

Professor Markus Dubber

2010-11

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/criminallawsecti02dubb

Table of Contents[†]

Introduction: General Approach*
Critical: comparative, historical, contextual
Dubber, Criminal Law in Comparative Perspective

Part I. Fundamentals & Frameworks
Chapter 1. The Province of Criminal Law*
A. Law and Police
Dubber, Legitimating Penal Law
Rousseau, Blackstone, Cyclopaedia of Political Science
Morris, Persons and Punishment
Fuller, Morality of Law
Code of Service Discipline
N.Y. Agric. & Mkts. Law § 121
After Travis the Chimp, a Police Officer's Descent
B. Public Law and Private Law
Dubber, Criminal Law Between Public and Private Law
Linden & Feldthusen, Functions of Tort Law
Assault in Crime and Tort
---, Tort, Crime, and Compensation for Victims
McMurtry Report
R. v. Cuerrier (snapshot); N.C. v. W.R.B.; Re Jane Doe (CICB)
C. Criminal Law in Canada: The Canadian Criminal Code
Friedland, Codification in the Commonwealth
Linden, Recodifying Canadian Criminal Law
Stephen, General View
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report (1879)
Stephen, Liberty, Equality, Fraternity (1874)
Stephen, A History of the Criminal Law of England (1883)
Self-Defense: A History in Codes

.....

Chapter 2. Theories and Concepts of Punishment vol. I
A. Theories ---- 1
R. v. C.A.M. ---- 1
R. v. Gladue ---- 14
R. Christie ---- 26
U.S. Federal Sentencing Guidelines ---- 33
B. Concepts ---- 38
R. v. Lyons ---- 38
R. v. L.M. ---- 50
Kansas v. Hendricks ---- 57

[†] Materials marked with an asterisk (*) are available on Blackboard only. All other materials appear in the bound coursebook; excerpts from the Law Reform Commission of Canada's draft criminal code (LRCC), the American Law Institute's Model Penal Code (MPC), and the German Criminal Code (StGB) can be found in the bound code supplement. Everything bound is also available online, but not vice versa.

Hörnle, Human-Rights Issues ---- 61
R. v. Wigglesworth ---- 62
R. v. Shubley ---- 69
Heath v. Alabama ---- 73

Chapter 3. Sources and Limits of the Power to Punish ---- 75
A. POGG and Criminal Law Power ---- 75
Margarine Reference ---- 75
R. v. Hydro-Québec ---- 77
Constitution Act, 1867 (esp. §§ 91 (& 92))*
Valverde, "Peace, Order, and Good Government"*
Holy Roman Empire of the German Nation, First Imperial Police Ordinance (1530)*
N.Y. State Police Regulations, 1781-1801*
B. Harm Principle ---- 86
R. v. Malmo-Levine ---- 86
Stephen, Liberty, Equality, Fraternity ---- 93
Dubber, Rechtsgut and Harm Principle*

Chapter 4. Legality Principle (*nulla poena*) ---- 96
A. Rule of Law/*Rechtsstaat* ---- 96
Fuller, Morality of Law*
Dubber, The Principle of Legality*
B. Legislativity ---- 96
Frey v. Fedoruk ---- 96
Commonwealth v. Keller ---- 103
Shaw v. DPP ---- 105
C. Specificity ---- 109
R. v. Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society ---- 109
D. Strict Construction/Lenity ---- 116
R. v. Paré ---- 116
E. Prospectivity ---- 121
Application under s. 83.28 of the Criminal Code ---- 121
F. Publicity ---- 128
R. v. Furtney ---- 128
G. Codification ---- 131
United Nurses of Alberta v. Alberta ---- 131

Chapter 5. Jurisdiction ---- 141
Davidson v. British Columbia ---- 141
Code of Service Discipline ---- 147
German Penal Code ---- 150

Chapter 6. Analysis of Criminal Liability ---- 153
A. Three Levels of Liability ---- 153
Dubber, Comparative Analysis of Criminal Liability ---- 154

Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report (1879) ---- 155
B. German Scheme ---- 155
Naucke, Insider's Perspective ---- 155
C. Victim Compensation Scheme ---- 157
Dubber, Analysis of Compensability ---- 157
Compensation for Victims of Crime Act (Ont.)*
D. Tort Scheme ---- 158
Linden, Tort Defences & German Civil Code § 823 ---- 158
E. An Application: The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---- 159
The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---- 159

Part II. General Principles of Criminal Law ---- 162
Chapter 7. Actus Reus (Objective Offense Elements) ---- 162
A. Actness ---- 162
People v. Davis ---- 162
LRCC §§ 2(2)-2(3)(a) ---- 164
MPC §§ 1.13(5), (9), 2.01 ---- 164
B. Voluntariness ---- 165
Rex v. Larsonneur ---- 165
R. v. Shaw ---- 166
Hill v. Baxter ---- 167
LRCC § 3(1) ---- 168
MPC § 2.01 ---- 169
C. Omission ---- 169
The Queen v. Instan ---- 169
People v. Robbins ---- 171
State v. Miranda ---- 173
R. v. Browne ---- 176
Fagan v. Commissioner of Metropolitan Police ---- 179
R. v. Miller ---- 182
LRCC § 2(3) ---- 184
MPC § 2.01 ---- 184
StGB § 13 ---- 184
French Penal Code Arts. 223-6, -7 ---- 184
StGB § 323c ---- 184
LRCC § 10(2) ---- 185
Quebéc Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms §§ 1, 2 ---- 185
D. Possession ---- 185
1. Significance and Variety ---- 185
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 185
Possession in the Canadian Criminal Code ---- 187
2. "Actus Reus" ---- 188
An Act for the better preventing the counterfeiting the current coin of this kingdom, 1697, 8 & 9 Will. 3, c. 26 (Eng.). ---- 188
An Act for the better prevention of offences, 1851, 14 & 15 Vict., c. 19 (Eng.)
Rex v. Lennard ---- 189

Dugdale v. Regina ---- 191
LRCC § 2(3) (comment) ---- 193
MPC § 2.01(4) ---- 193
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 193
3. Varieties of Possession ---- 194
a. actual (physical) ---- 194
Rex v. Hess ---- 194
R. v. Beaver ---- 199
b. constructive ---- 205
(i) personal ---- 205
R. v. Christie ---- 205
(ii) joint ---- 208
R. v. Williams ---- 208
R. v. Chambers ---- 212
4. Presumptions ---- 215
R. v. Oakes ---- 215
Dubber, Policing Possession ---- 222

Chapter 8. Mens Rea (Subjective Offense Elements) ---- 224
A. Voluntariness and Culpable Mental States ---- 224
In the Matter of Ronnie L. ---- 224
B. Schemes of Mental States ---- 226
C. Definitions ---- 227
LRCC § 2(4) ---- 227
MPC § 2.02, N.Y. Penal Law § 15.05 ---- 227
StGB § 15 ---- 228
StGB (Alternative Draft) §§ 17, 18 ---- 228
D. The Boundaries of Intent: Varieties of Subjective Fault ---- 229
Lewis v. The Queen ---- 229
R. v. Steane ---- 234
Dunbar v. The King ---- 237
Paquette v. The Queen ---- 238
R. v. Buzzanga ---- 241
MPC § 2.02(8) ---- 254
R. v. Hibbert ---- 254
E. The Boundaries of Culpability: Subjective vs. Objective Fault ---- 267
R. v. Caldwell ---- 267
R. v. G and another ---- 271
R. v. Tutton and Tutton ---- 281
R. v. Hundal ---- 292
R v. Beatty ---- 299
F. Constitutional Constraints ---- 312
1. Strict and Absolute Liability ---- 313
Rex v. Ping Yuen ---- 313
Beaver v. The Queen ---- 315
R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie ---- 315

Reference Re: Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act ---------- 321
Wholesale Travel Group Inc. v. The Queen ---------- 326
Sayre, Public Welfare Offenses ---------- 354
Morissette v. United States ---------- 355
MPC §§ 2.02(3), (4), 2.05 ---------- 357
2. Constructive Murder ---------- 357
R. v. Vaillancourt ---------- 357
R. v. Martineau ---------- 368
LRCC § 6(3) ---------- 380
MPC §§ 210.2, .3 ---------- 381
StGB § 211-213 ---------- 382
3. Foreseeability ---------- 382
R. v. DeSousa ---------- 382
R. v. Creighton ---------- 390

Chapter 9. Causation vol. 2
R. v. Winning ---------- 413
R. v. Roberts ---------- 413
Pagett v. The Queen ---------- 415
R. v. Cheshire ---------- 417
R. v. Smithers ---------- 422
R. v. Blaue ---------- 423
R. v. Cribbin ---------- 426
R. v. Nette ---------- 433
LRCC § 2(6) ---------- 448
MPC § 2.03 ---------- 448
People v. Kibbe ---------- 448

Chapter 10. Inchoate Crimes ---------- 451
A. Attempt ---------- 451
1. Concepts and Types of Attempt ---------- 451
LRCC § 4(3) ---------- 451
StGB §§ 22-23 ---------- 451
MPC §§ 5.01, 5.05(1) ---------- 451
2. Mens Rea ---------- 451
Lajoie v. The Queen ---------- 451
R. v. Ancio ---------- 456
3. "Actus Reus": Incomplete Attempts ---------- 461
R. v. Cline ---------- 461
R. v. Sorrell and Bondett ---------- 464
Deutsch v. The Queen ---------- 469
People v. Lehnert ---------- 473
4. Impossibility ---------- 477
R. v. Scott ---------- 477
R. v. Shivpuri ---------- 479
USA v. Dynar ---------- 484

People v. Dlugash ---- 506
B. Counselling ---- 508
R. v. McLeod et al. ---- 508
R. v. Gordon and Gordon ---- 509
R. v. Lepage ---- 510
LRCC § 4(4) ---- 510
MPC § 5.02 ---- 510
C. Conspiracy ---- 510
R. v. Dèry ---- 510
USA v. Dynar ---- 518
LRCC § 4(5) ---- 524
MPC § 5.03(1), (5), (6) ---- 524

Chapter 11. Liability for Another's Conduct ---- 525
A. Concepts and Types of Derivative Liability ---- 525
LRCC § 4(1), 4(2) ---- 525
StGB §§ 25, 26, 27, 29 ---- 525
MPC § 2.06(1)-(3), (6)(c) ---- 525
B. Complicity ---- 525
R. v. Kulbacki ---- 525
R. v. Salajko ---- 526
Dunlop and Sylvester v. The Queen ---- 527
R. v. Logan ---- 533
C. Abandonment ---- 539
R. v. Whitehouse ---- 539
R. v. Gonzague ---- 541
People v. Staples ---- 545
StGB § 24 ---- 546
MPC §§ 2.06(6)(c), 5.01(4), 5.02(3), 5.03(6) ---- 546
N.Y. Penal Law § 40.10 ---- 546
D. Vicarious Liability (respondeat superior) ---- 547
Regina v. Hawinda Taverns Ltd. ---- 547
E. Corporate Liability ---- 549
Rex v. Fane Robinson Ltd. ---- 549
Regina v. Waterloo Mercury Sales Ltd. ---- 553
Canadian Dredge and Dock Co. Ltd. et al. v. The Queen ---- 553
LRCC § 2(5) ---- 557
MPC § 2.07 ---- 558
People v. Congregational Khal Chaisidei Skwere, Inc. ---- 558
Weigend, Societas delinquere non potest?*

Chapter 12. Mistake & Intoxication ---- 560
A. Mistake ---- 560
1. Mistake of Fact ---- 560
R. v. Rees ---- 560
R. v. Metro News Ltd. ---- 562

R. v. Pappajohn ---------- 566
R. v. Sansregret ---------- 578
R. v. Osolin ---------- 586
R. v. Ladue ---------- 596
R. v. Burgess ---------- 598
R. v. Vlcko ---------- 599
R. v. Kundeus ---------- 599
LRCC § 3(2) ---------- 609
MPC § 2.04(1) ---------- 609
StGB § 16 ---------- 609
2. Mistake of Law ---------- 610
R. v. Campbell and Mlynarchuk ---------- 610
Rex v. Ross ---------- 613
The Statutory Instruments Act ---------- 615
R. v. Molis ---------- 615
R. v. Pontes ---------- 619
R. ex rel. v. Dalley ---------- 635
R. v. Jorgensen ---------- 638
Lévis (City) v. Tétreault ---------- 642
R. v. Shymkowich ---------- 646
R. v. Howson ---------- 647
LRCC § 3(7) ---------- 649
MPC § 2.04(3), (4) ---------- 649
StGB § 17 ---------- 649
B. Intoxication ---------- 649
DDP v. Beard ---------- 649
DPP v. Majewski ---------- 653
Bernard v. The Queen ---------- 656
R. v. Daviault ---------- 668
LRCC § 3(3) ---------- 688
MPC § 2.08 ---------- 688
StGB § 323a ---------- 688

Chapter 13. Justification vol. 3
A. Concepts and Types of Defense ---------- 689
Blackstone, Commentaries ---------- 689
Criminal Code Bill Commission, Report ---------- 689
R. v. Perka ---------- 690
Naucke, "An Insider's Perspective" ---------- 690
LRCC ch. 3 ---------- 691
N.Y. Penal Law § 25 ---------- 691
Patterson v. New York ---------- 691
R. v. Whyte ---------- 692
B. Protection of Persons Administering and Enforcing the Law ---------- 692
R. v. Brennan ---------- 692
LRCC § 3(13) ---------- 696

MPC §§ 3.03, 3.07 ---- 696
C. Persons in Authority ---- 696
Canadian Foundation for Children, Youth and the Law v. Canada ---- 697
LRCC § 3(14) ---- 711
MPC § 3.08 ---- 711
D. Self-Defense ---- 711
R. v. Cadwallader ---- 711
R. v. Bogue ---- 715
Lavallee v. The Queen ---- 720
R. v. Deegan ---- 734
R. v. Faid ---- 735
LRCC § 3(10) ---- 735
MPC § 3.03 ---- 736
StGB §§ 32-33 ---- 736
E. Consent ---- 736
R. v. Jobidon ---- 736
R. v. Cuerrier ---- 754
R. v. Ewanchuk ---- 778
MPC § 2.11 ---- 789
F. Necessity ---- 789
The Queen v. Dudley and Stephens ---- 789
R. v. Perka ---- 789
R. v. Latimer ---- 808
LRCC § 3(9) ---- 816
MPC § 3.02 ---- 816
StGB § 34 ---- 816

Chapter 14. Excuse ---- 817
A. Incapacity ("Exemption") ---- 817
1. Insanity ---- 817
a. Definition ---- 817
R. v. Cooper ---- 817
Kjeldsen v. The Queen ---- 822
R. v. Abbey ---- 823
R. v. Kirkby ---- 825
Schwartz v. The Queen ---- 825
Chaulk v. The Queen ---- 830
Stephen, 1878 Draft Bill ---- 837
Criminal Code Bill Commission, 1879 Draft Bill ---- 837
Canadian Criminal Code, 1892 ---- 838
Canadian Criminal Code (current) ---- 838
LRCC § 3(6) ---- 838
MPC § 4.01 ---- 838
StGB § 20 ---- 838
b. Defense (vs. Element of Liability vs. Symptom vs. Offense) ---- 839
R. v. Saxell ---- 839

R. v. Swain ---- 839
c. Burden of Proof ---- 854
Chaulk v. The Queen ---- 854
People v. Kohl ---- 874
d. Diminished Responsibility ---- 877
More v. The Queen ---- 877
R. v. Wright ---- 880
MPC §§ 4.02, 210.3(1)(b) ---- 881
StGB § 21 ---- 881
e. Irresistible Impulse ---- 882
R. v. Borg ---- 882
2. Infancy ---- 887
R. v. Sawchuk ---- 887
R. v. Ogg-Moss ---- 888
LRCC § 3(4) ---- 894
MPC § 4.10 ---- 894
StGB § 19 ---- 894
3. "Insane Automatism" ---- 894
R. v. Quick ---- 894
R. v. Rabey ---- 898
R. v. Parks ---- 907
R. v. Stone ---- 916
B. Inability ---- 952
1. Duress ---- 952
The Queen v. Carker (No. 2) ---- 952
R. v. Hibbert ---- 955
R. v. Ruzic ---- 964
LRCC § 3(8) ---- 979
MPC § 2.09 ---- 979
StGB § 35 ---- 979
2. Provocation ---- 979
Salamon v. The Queen ---- 979
R. v. Hill ---- 982
R. v. Galgay ---- 991
R. v. Thibert ---- 992
R. v. Parent ---- 1000
MPC § 210(3)(1)(b) ---- 1003
StGB § 213 ---- 1004
3. Entrapment ---- 1004
Mack v. The Queen ---- 1004
Barnes v. The Queen ---- 1022
MPC § 2.13 ---- 1032
N.Y. Penal Law § 40.05 ---- 1032
People v. DeGina ---- 1032
Ross, Tradeoffs in Undercover Investigations ---- 1034